A CASE STUDY; ANALYSIS OF THE TRANSFORMATION OF TRADITIONAL COMMERCIAL SPACES IN BALIKESIR

In this chapter, the historical transformation of the relationship between traditional urban fabric and shopping space studied in Chapter 3 within the context of traditional settlements in Anatolia will further be examined. This examination will be realised with particular reference to Balikesir as a significant town of Western Anatolia which used to be a leading region in industrialisation, modernisation, westernisation and regional economic development.

In this chapter, it is intended to suggest a series of physical and spatial criteria for the future development of shopping spaces in Balikesir, within the framework of the alternative approach established in the previous chapter. Therefore, the following steps will be taken:

1. Review of the historical evolution of shopping activities and spaces in order to be able to identify spatial transformation of shopping places in Balikesir; in this framework,
   i) Boundaries of the study area will be defined and then,
   ii) The differentiation observed in the social structure during this historical process,
   iii) Transformation of urban fabric in Balikesir until the 20th century as well as the spatial characteristics of public spaces within the traditional urban fabric,
   iv) Transformation of commercial activities and that of shopping spaces until the 20th century will be analysed.

2. Existing shopping spaces in the study area will be analysed from the viewpoint of;
   i) The relationships between commercial activities and social fabric,
   ii) Existing relationships between commercial activities and shopping spaces.

At the end of this chapter, a comparison between the existing shopping spaces in Balikesir and the public spaces of the city from morphological point of view, and several suggestions will be presented for the future development of shopping spaces within the framework of the approach developed in the fourth chapter.
5.1 General Description and Historical Development of Shopping Activities and Spaces in Balıkesir

It is the aim of this section to analyse the evolution of shopping activity and spaces will be examined to apprehend the spatial transformation in shopping spaces of Balıkesir. The objective here is to identify spatial characteristics which display continuity from the past to present in the shopping spaces of Balıkesir.

In this section, the transformation of shopping spaces and activities in Balıkesir before the 20th century will be dealt with. During this investigation, the transformation of both activities and spaces will be interpreted in connection with the characteristics of the transformation in both urban and social fabrics. Thus, it is intended to investigate shopping spaces of Balıkesir in historical perspective particularly from the viewpoint of creating ‘shopping places with social attributes’.

Prior to historical overview to be conducted in Balıkesir it would be quite helpful to summarise the developments brought by modern planning briefly, in order to be able to conceive the transformation that occurred during the 20th century, and thus, to be able to place the transformation of Balıkesir into this broader framework.

As studied in the second chapter, the interaction between the city and the buildings has been a relationship rejected by the modernist urban planning approach. However, as expressed in the anti-modern rhetoric, particularly in 1970s (Lynch, Rossi, Krier), city is accepted as a morphological entity and the concepts of architecture and city are re-defined generating from traditional values on the contrary to the advocates of modernist thinking (Yıldırım 1996).

In recent studies regarding traditional towns, modernist doctrine, which suggests the zoning of city into specific functional districts and distribution of urban activities into these zones, seems to be deprived of its validity. Therefore, one can assume that a post-modern viewpoint dominates the overall structure of the study.

The process of emergence and development of traditional town and that of modern city are completely different from each other. Pre-industrial town is a self-organising entity gradually emerging throughout ages, and all man-made artefacts are in harmony with each other. The unity in traditional city has naturally emerged through clear distinction of public and private spaces right from the very beginning, and their formation as a result of their functions.
One of the most important factors determining the formation of traditional cities is the weight of commercial activities. The development of commercial life, have naturally brought together the enhancement of social life, intensity and vividness of public activities and spaces with it.

Shops, stores (or Çarşı) which were commercial spaces of pre-industrial period, were the major spaces besides religious, military and administrative buildings to which citizens go to meet their various needs and the position of these spaces within the general form of the city has emerged as a result of the division of city into functional zones. The outlook of cities as well as their commercial spaces gained a new image along with the rapid growth of cities as a result of massive population increase in the 19th century after the Industrial Revolution, particularly under the influence of changes in the social and economic structure. 19th century is of crucial importance for Anatolian cities, like those in Europe, particularly from the viewpoint of the transformation of spatial structure of cities. Following the 16th century, the urban space which had not experienced a noticeable transformation during 17th and 18th centuries, have started to witness a radical transformation process as a result of drastic changes in trade in the 19th century. That one of the major determinants effecting the urban spatial organisation is the regional commerce in the 19th century can be clearly observed in Anatolian cities.

Balıkesir, too, is among these Western Anatolian towns affected by this transformation. Urban growth in Balıkesir also carries these qualities which are generally valid for all Anatolian towns. In this section, firstly the economic, social and architectural past of Balıkesir, then transformation of commercial activity and retail spaces in Balıkesir during the 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th centuries, and finally differentiation in urban space in parallel to the above-defined transformation will be summarised. Although existing urban structure seem to have almost totally lost its traditional features pertaining to pre-19th century period, it still retains the traces of the circulation network clarified particularly in post-19th century period. It can even be said that the commercial district of the city has not exhibited even today, any sprawl or enlargement from its 20th century boundaries. These conditions may cause various physical and functional problems in the commercial district of the urban core. It is of particular interest to briefly review; the history of Balıkesir, its commercial spaces in the past, the structure of urban-public spaces and their transformation through time. It is intended to identify spatial characteristics of existing commercial spaces and their position within the unity of urban-public spaces. It is also aimed to establish various
reference points towards the future development of shopping spaces and buildings in Balıkesir.

Balıkesir, in history, is one of the significant Ottoman cities through not as much as metropolitan cities like İstanbul, İzmir, Bursa and Ankara. The function of commerce, which the city itself as well as its provinces has had in Ottoman era, particularly during 17th and 18th centuries, is obviously the most influential factor in the significance of Balıkesir acquired. That the geographical position of city partially connects Anatolian provinces to those of Roumelia, and that city provides the possibilities for the transportation of row materials and products to Western Anatolia, İstanbul and then to abroad through her ports opening to both Aegean sea and Marmara, can be considered as the indicators of how commercial activity, at the time, could have been developed in the city.

As known, socio-economic structure and spatial organisation have not been exposed to any significant change in Anatolian-Ottoman cities during the 17th and 18th centuries. However, social structure and qualities of commercial activities have started to clearly differentiate in comparison to preceding eras beginning from the first quarter of the 19th century. This differentiation has directly influenced the spatial organisation of the city. Particularly, due to rapid transformation in socio-economic field, commercial spaces of the city have exhibited the tendency to spread out along the new axes that emerged as the extensions of the city, instead of commercial spaces having one single centre (Aktüre 1981, İpekoğlu, 1996).

As Tekeli asserts, the introverted urban structure in Anatolian cities of the nineteenth century has started to develop in an extraverted manner due to the developments in foreign trade. In this period, new building typologies have started to prop up such as station, harbour, post office, warehouse, hotel and bank as a result of the transformation of the functions of the city, particularly trade. Thus, caravanserai or han have differentiated and turned into stations, warehouses or hotels (Tekeli 1987). It is possible to observe an example of such development seen all over the country, in Balıkesir too yet at another scale. New trade hans have started to be built nearby the banks and hotels as new building types, and bedesten and its surroundings taking place in the historical core of the city since the 16th century have left their commercial dominance to the area where banks and office buildings are located (Figure 5.1).
On the other hand, these new buildings that were introduced into the city life in the 19\textsuperscript{th} century, have not totally removed the old institutions of the city, in parallel to the dual social structure emerging with the social stratification experienced in the city, a bipartite city structure has also appeared in city centres. Tradesman and craftsman dealing with small scale retailing, and their commercial spaces that is traditional crafts bazaars have managed to keep their 16\textsuperscript{th} and 17\textsuperscript{th} century positions until about late-19\textsuperscript{th} century. New shops and khans, in which imported products from West were sold as a result of transformation of foreign trade relationships in cities, have started to constitute the new commercial centres built along the extensions of traditional centres and on both sides of the main thoroughfares. The points determining the direction of development were now the new urban elements emerged in the 19\textsuperscript{th} century, such as administrative centre and railway station etc. (Figure 5.2, Figure 5.3). These two components are assumed as the determinants of newly developed commercial zones almost in all Anatolian towns during 19\textsuperscript{th} century (Aktüre 1981).
5.1.1 Determining the Boundaries and Limitations of Study Area

In this section, the boundaries of the study area are determined. The continuity and unity of traditional tissue have been the basis of this definition.

**Historical, functional and spatial criteria** have been effective in the definition of the district to be selected as the study area. At this stage, firstly the district, which was the shopping space of traditional city, is determined. Then, the area in which the
commercial activity is concentrated is identified. Finally, characteristics of the area which remarkably varied than the other areas, is taken as the study area.

The study area is the district that sustained its characteristics of being the major shopping area within the urban structure of Balıkesir for the last 500 years. As stated in the sources studied, a remarkably intensive commercial activity had been observed during 17th, 18th and particularly 19th centuries. Today, however, the area sustains its commercial function, where traditional and contemporary shopping spaces take place together, yet the area is considered as worthy of analysis due to the fact that traditional ways of shopping still, though partially, prevail.

Study area is limited with the market hall in the north, the axis extending from Ali Hikmet Paşa Square towards north and commercial buildings along the periphery on the east, the section of Anafartalar Street built-up after 1950s in the south and Aygören Quarter where housing is quite dense at the western side of the area (Figure 5.4).

Commercial building complexes, which take place in the area as the focus of investigation, are Yeni Çarşı and Hasan Baba Çarşı. Meanwhile, the components of square and street that constitute the urban image in the area still carry the required potential of being a contemporary ‘shopping place with social attributes’ with their spatial and symbolic characteristics, although they have almost totally lost their traditional functions and forms, and thus have become almost unperceivable (Figure 5.5).

![Figure 5.4 Study Area](Source: Aru, K. A.; Türk Kenti, YEM Yayınları, İstanbul, 1998, p.)
5.1.2 Economical, Social and Architectural Context of Balıkesir

In this section, the differentiation occurred in the social fabric of Balıkesir throughout the historical process will be investigated. In this context, an overall portrait of commercial activities in Balıkesir during the period until the end of 19th century will be drawn. In the next section, sociological foundations for the evaluation of urban spaces, which set the stage for these activities, will be prepared.

When social and economic structure of Balıkesir is viewed in historical perspective, it can be seen that the city has witnessed a very intense and lively commercial activity particularly in the period until the 20th century. Social structure has had an introverted quality as could be seen in most of the Anatolian cities at the time. Thus, social life used to occur in commercial spaces taking place in the urban core in this type of cities, which did not have spaces for public use.

When social and economic past of Balıkesir is examined, it can be seen that major general structural changes did not occur in the 17th century. Balıkesir, in the 18th century, is a provincial centre dependent on the Anatolian Governorship whose capital was Kütahya. Karesi Province (Balıkesir), comprises almost the current legal boundaries of Balıkesir except a small land in the eastern part.
It is claimed that Balıkesir, which was already an attractive city during the reign of Karesioğulları with the richness of bazaars and the multitude of population, has become a much more exquisite city with the construction boom of numerous mosques, medreses, dervish lodges mainly after Ottoman conquest (Su 1937).

In various written sources, it is stated that production and retail activity was quite diversified in Balıkesir during the 17th, 18th and 19th centuries (Su 1937, Eren 1993, Egli 1945). In that period, textile and leather work in the city, olive oil, soap production and mining in the provinces, and also agriculture and live-stock were the major production activities. Particularly, the production of textile, soap and olive oil has reached a level almost at the scale of supplying the demand of entire Ottoman Empire, rather than sufficing for the need of the city. Moreover, it is known that an important part of the goods produced in the city was exported to European countries.

There had been a large group of organised tradesman in the 17th and 18th centuries, and each group of tradesman had their own bazaar. Aba making, which was one of these trades, was a significant field of production dating back to the period of Karesioğulları. The aba produced in the city was so valuable because of its strength that they not only used to meet the need of Balıkesir, but also were sold in nearby cities including İstanbul. Military uniforms in İstanbul were also produced out of these textiles manufactured in Balıkesir (Su 1937).

The city and commercial life in Balıkesir during the 18th century had been enlivened with the merchants coming from Van, Bitlis, Kayseri, and even Aleppo and Damascus. Besides, other merchants from Syria, Eastern Anatolia, Roumelia, Hungary, Austria, Walachia and Moldavia also influenced the retail activities in the city around the same period (Su 1937).

At that time, every kind of goods could be found in the markets of Balıkesir. While some of these were produced in the city itself, the rest was imported. It is known that a multitude of goods used to be brought form İran to Balıkesir as in many other cities. The first stop for the caravans coming from Aleppo, Damascus, İran, Baghdad, Diyarbakır and Tokat was Konya. These caravans used to be distributed from here towards surrounding cities including Balıkesir. Some materials such as iron, which is brought to Balıkesir and its provinces from Roumelia was brought from Bandırma port. Goods imported from France were brought first to İzmir, then from here to Balıkesir via Sabuncubeli, Manisa and Akhisar carriageway (Su 1937).
Export of Balıkesir in the 17th and 18th centuries was much more significant in comparison to its import (Su 1937). At that time, Balıkesir was an agricultural centre in the prosperous lands of which various vegetables and fruits, sesame, poppy, cotton and corn are produced, and a marketplace where these goods are collected together and sold outside.

In this era, Balıkesir seems to have had an important role in the process of establishment of the relationships of the Ottoman Empire with the global economic system. Boracite, lead and marble extracted form the provinces of Balıkesir used to be exported, and city was an important mining export centre of Ottoman State.

It is stated that, Balıkesir had a very advantageous position from the viewpoints of both internal and foreign trade in the 19th century (Mutaf 1997). The crafts of textile and tanning have extensive influence on the trade in the city at the time (Egli 1938). Although aba making, which dated back to the era of Karesioğulları, may seem to have lost its former importance, it still prevailed to meet the local needs, particularly at the hand-benches (Egli 1938).

In that period, production of soap, oil, wine, carpet, textile, cotton, silk, and wool as well as products of agriculture, forestry, and mining industry have caused concentrated activity of foreign trade in Balıkesir. The city was not only self-sufficient with these products, but also capable of selling them to neighbouring vicinities (Mutaf, 1997).

The olive-oil brought from Karesi Province in the 19th century had won a competition in the International Paris Fair of 1867. The eight million kilograms of olive-oil production from Balıkesir at the time, used to be exported to Russia, Romania, England and many other countries. Another industry which used to play an important role in the regional economy was the production of soap. In that period, the majority of soap produced in Balıkesir was being exported to Russia and Balkans. On the other hand, since the livestock was considerably developed in the city during the 19th century, fleece and mohair used to be exported to Europe and cream was sold to Istanbul (Ilgürel, 1992).

The industrial goods that were not produced in the region used to be usually provided through the import of these goods. The abundance of the nearby ports in the region has brought an advantageous position to Balıkesir. The major ports, form which Karesi Province could export and import goods, were Bandırma-Erdek, Edremit-Avcılar and İliça, Ayvalık and Burhaniye-Hamidiye (Mutaf 1997).
As can be seen, Balikesir was quite a significant commercial centre in the past. Thus, shopping spaces in the city were fairly developed in these periods. At this point, it is of particular interest to know transformation of urban spaces in Balikesir until the 20\textsuperscript{th} century.

5.1.3 Transformation of Urban Spaces in Balikesir until the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century

Investigation of the transformation in the urban fabric of Balikesir until 20\textsuperscript{th} century and spatial characteristics of public spaces in the traditional urban fabric will be the subject of this chapter. In this framework, public-works in Balikesir, plan interventions and their impacts on the urban components, as studied in Chapter 2 and 4, will be taken up.

The studies regarding the urban growth of Balikesir are quite scarce and scattered. In the literature review, it can be seen that a detailed study about the urban structure of Balikesir in the pre-Republican era does not exist.

The urban growth of Balikesir had started with Seljuks, and later it gained significance with its capture first by Karesi Province, and then by Ottoman Empire in 1341. In the logbook of the İbn-i Batuta who visited the city in 1333, it is mentioned that the city was founded on a very limited area, yet had a very large bazaar. According to the very same source, it was a small town composed of scattered neighbourhoods in the 15\textsuperscript{th} century when Zağnos Paşa, Grand Vizier of Sultan Yavuz Selim, who was the patron of numerous buildings in Balikesir where he moved in after he left his duty as Vizier.

As mentioned above, Balikesir had a status stemming from the intensity of commercial activity during 17\textsuperscript{th} and 18\textsuperscript{th} centuries. However, as Cerasi asserts, the economic structure which started to change at the end of 18\textsuperscript{th} and during the 19\textsuperscript{th} centuries have led the way for greater cities of Ottoman Empire to further develop whereas smaller Anatolian towns to stagnate and thus to develop less for about two centuries (Cerasi 2001). In that case, cities of both administrative and commercial importance have further developed with the influence of their regional commercial potential. The period for smaller settlements such as Balikesir to develop and to set a stage for intensive building activity is the era following the foundation of the Republic.

Besides, it is known that the first planned activity of public-works started in 1863 in Balikesir. It is stated that Ahmet Vefik Paşa, who was the inspector of Karesi
Province, had realised a comprehensive public-works boom\(^1\). At that time, narrow and tortuous streets were enlarged, new streets were opened and cul-de-sacs were rehabilitated and a large amount of real estate was expropriated. In the beginning of 1913, at the time of Kemal Bey, who was the governor of Karesi, one of the busiest and the most commercially active streets of the city, Milli Kuvvetler Street (this was named as İstasyon Street since it constituted the axis connecting municipality building into the railway station) was opened (Figure 5.6). It is known that during the opening of the street many houses were also expropriated.

The first master plan of Balıkesir, including 1/2000, 1/1000 and 1/500 scale sheets, was prepared in 1941 within the framework of general planned public-works movement following the foundation of the Republic (Figure 5.7, Figure 5.8). The plan was approved in 1944 and started to be executed until 1955.

It can be noticed that regular building blocks are intended in Eğli plan within the framework of Modernist approach. In his reports, it is emphasised that urban growth should be in the directions of north and east, and it is stated that city owned the characteristics of a city centre due to the its position appropriate for development mainly because of the railway passing through the city although it did not have a background as historical as Edirne or Bursa.

\(^1\) [http://www.balikesir-bld.gov.tr/tarihdebazi.htm](http://www.balikesir-bld.gov.tr/tarihdebazi.htm)
In the report, where town centre and commercial zone is investigated, the analyses include the classification of squares and roads (Figure 5.9). Here, the evaluations and suggestions of Egli regarding first the squares and then streets of Balıkesir will be put forward.

Egli in his report, claims that there are five major squares, namely Gar (Station) Square, Government Square, New Municipal Square, Commercial Square, Museum Square and eight basic circulation routes among them.

Gar Square (Figure 5.10) necessitates the correct solution of the traffic problem since four main thoroughfares in the widths of 10.5 m., 16 m., 24 m. and 12 m., intersect at this very square. Egli points out that the façades of the building blocks towards the city should be tackled as the wall of a square, thus states that it would be appropriate to handle the buildings, which were to be built around the square, in relation to each other.

Figure 5.7 Improvement Plan of Balıkesir, E. Egli 1944.
(Source: Balıkesir Municipality archives)
Figure 5.8    Improvement Plan of Balıkesir, E. Egli 1944. Detailed redrawn by Gaye Birol. (Source: Balıkesir Municipality archives)

Figure 5.9    Circulation system of Balıkesir in Egli Plan. (Source: Balıkesir Municipality archives)
Government Square (Figure 5.11), is designed as a plaza defined by the central administrative building which was built at the time. According to Egli, there were significant architectural mistakes in regard to position, height and architectural qualities of the façades of this building. It also negatively influenced the quality of this square which was claimed to take place in front of it.

New Municipal Square (Figure 5.12) differed from the other squares in the city particularly from the viewpoint of level differences and the slope exceeding 10%. These characteristics played a major role in the formation of New Municipal Square. According to Egli, the square could have gained a distinct and sincere outlook by means of the construction of retaining walls and green terraces.
According to Egli, Commercial Square (Figure 5.13) should be handled in a manner to preserve existing retail spaces and the market place as much as possible. Commercial Square was the heart of daily commercial life. Moreover, decoration of the square with a monument could not be of an issue. As Egli stated, elements of public interest such as sitting areas, newspaper stands, notice boards, bargaining spaces etc. should take place in this space. Other examples of this sort, that is shopping places under a plane tree could also be seen in various cities such as Istanbul, Bursa, etc. In places like there, retail is performed not nearby the square but exactly in the square, and thus square directly becomes an open exchange hall (Egli 1945). It was not possible to obtain any drawing or photograph depicting the state of the square before the 1950 fire.
According to Egli, the primary circulation scheme is determined as the connections between; New Municipal Square-Commercial Square-Museum Square, New Municipal Square-Government Square-stadium, Commercial Square-station, Commercial Square-Edremit motorway, Commercial Square-Government Square, Museum Square-station, Museum Square-Government Square, and Station Square-Government Square. In the period when the report was prepared, some of these streets were opened and some of the others were under construction. Egli had determined the appropriate widths for all these streets and added that the heights of buildings surrounding the two sides of each street should also be determined in accordance with these widths. For instance, the connection between Museum Square and Station Square, known as Gazi Boulevard today, was a 24 meter wide thoroughfare. According to Egli, it was required to built significant and relatively larger administrative buildings rather than simple, low-rise housing buildings. Thus, appropriate scale and level of enclosure could be provided for the boulevard.

Various revisions had been made on Egli Plan that was prepared in 1941 and executed after 1944 with the approval of municipality, and this plan is totally abandoned in 1955. With a resolution taken in 1963, Egli Plan was re-endorsed yet an overall revision was also made on the plan. In that scope, 1/1000 scale plans of existing situation were prepared. In 1965, it was decided that a new plan should be prepared since Egli Plan was no longer adequate. The preparatory groundwork was completed in 1968 and a contract was signed with İller Bankası. The plan that was prepared in 1970 was approved in 1972 and revised in 1974. It was stated in mid-1980s that this new plan became also insufficient to meet the increasing demands and it was started to work towards a new master plan. Finally, a new master plan was completed in 1984. Although 1984 plan was also revised to a great extent in recent years, it still is carried out.

Consequently, the following spatial characteristics can be attained as the result of the investigations of transformations, which the urban growth of Balıkesir has gone through:

- Characteristics of traditional fabric
  - Detached neighbourhoods
  - Narrow and curvilinear streets
  - Cul-de-sacs
• Modernist arrangement proposals
  • Constitution of regular building blocks
  • Enlargement of narrow streets
  • Formation of development axes in the direction of north and east
  • Assembling the façades of building blocks in a manner to constitute the wall of a square
  • Proposal of social activities and appropriate elements related with shopping to one of the important squares (Commercial or Ali Hikmet Paşa Square as known today).

5.1.4 Evolution and Transformation of Commercial Activities and Shopping Spaces in Balıkesir until the 20th Century

In this section, the differentiations, which have been occurring in the social fabric of Balıkesir through historical process, will be analysed. In this context, an overall portrait of the commercial activities in the period until the end of the 19th century will be drawn, and in the following section, sociological foundations for the evaluation of urban spaces, which sets the stage for these activities, will be laid.

As stated above, despite the vividness of commercial life in Balıkesir during 17th, 18th and 19th centuries, commercial spaces of the time were quite primitive wooden buildings of one of two storey shops. In that era, commercial centre of the city is the current commercial core of the city.

During the 17th and 18th centuries, merchants coming from nearby cities as well as those from foreign countries to Balıkesir, which was quite crowded and commercially developed, had state in khans of the city. The most well known khans of the 17th century were İlyas Paşa and Hasan Paşa Khans. Apart from these two, Mahmut Ağa, Hüseyin Paşa, Mustafa Çelebi and Hacı Halil Khans were also among the well-known khans (İlgürel 1992). It is asserted that these were built around 17th and 18th centuries. İlyas Paşa Khan that was assumed to be built at the beginning of the 17th century had 72 rooms, and it was restorated in the middle of the 17th century. This khan, which was later named as ‘Abahane Khan’ was expropriated in 1952 by the Municipality of Balıkesir, and demolished in 1953 (Türkdili Newspaper, 08.06.1953) and replaced with the construction of current market building (Su 1937). It is not possible to obtain any
information regarding the spatial-physical characteristics of khans of the time in Balıkesir. Demolished khans were usually replaced with the construction of bank buildings.

Strange as it may appear, among the buildings remained from the Ottoman Era in Balıkesir, commercial building could hardly be seen. Although it is known that each tradesman group had their own bazaars, it was not possible to find information and evidences about their locations, and spatial and physical relationships in between them either.

Zağnos Paşa Bedesten and its 92 shops, which was cited in various sources and assumed to be in between Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Zağnos Paşa Bath, were demolished in a great fire towards the middle of the 17th century (1644 or 1645) (Su 1937). It was not possible to find information about the architectural qualities of the building. However, it is stated in the 17th and 18th century documents that the bedesten built by Zağnos Paşa and its surroundings were the most crowded, busiest and the most attractive bazaar that is the principal commercial centre of the city. It is known that valuable and important textiles, trade of which was forbidden elsewhere, were sold. It is asserted in written sources that just after 1897 earthquake a new bedesten of 62 shops were being constructed in the very same location during 1898 (Eren 1993), yet this building does not exist today.

The fire of 3rd August 1950 caused the total destruction of old commercial district consisting of more than nearly 500 one or two storey shops. In the years following the fire (1954-55), a modern arcaded shopping complex of two storey shops (Yeni Çarşı) was built in the area where old commercial district once existed (Figure 5.14). A series of articles were published in Türkdili Newspaper in 1950s regarding the public view, criticisms and expectations about Yeni Çarşı (Türkdili, 19, 20, 21 September 1950). Here, it is basically pointed out that; the construction of a building of massive blocks into an area formerly was built as a low-storey and piecemeal fabric would be inappropriate from the viewpoint of human scale, division of the buildings into standard sized shop units would neglect both the specific spatial requirements of different tradesman, and the appropriate service and circulation spaces for loading and unloading goods. On the other hand, it was also stated that this new shopping complex had many disadvantages from the viewpoint of urban planning. It was suggested that such great fires could have been seen as an opportunity to enlarge the existing Commercial Square in similar to plazas in the West, yet this new building (group of blocks) would narrow
the square as the result of a contrary approach. This building complex is still being used today. Thus, the Ottoman Bazaar in which production and retail activities of the city were realised has left its place into a totally different scene. Traditional shopping district of dense, wooden, single-storey, simple shops have been replaced with a regular planned building complex with the construction of Yeni Çarşı. Its construction has led the formation of ground-floor bazaars (passages) in the city centre and thus paves the way for a comprehensive urban transformation.

However, the first signals of such transformation were given with the opening of Milli Kuvvetler Street in 1916. The beginnings of this transformation have occurred in a quite similar manner to other Western Anatolian cities. This urban transformation is, at the same time, the transformation of both economic and social structure. The developments generating this transformation and its basic characteristics will be analysed below.

Primarily, trade agreements with European countries in the 19th century and resultingly changing commercial relations have caused small scale production in Balıkesir, like many other Anatolian cities, to lose its significance. Along with the introduction of cheaper goods produced in European countries with advanced technology, local textile produces in Balıkesir could not compete with these goods, and the number of weaving benches has rapidly declined.

Thus, spatial structure of commerce has started to differ with the changes occurred in the socio-economic context of Balıkesir in the 19th century. Commercial
spaces have started to spread outside the traditional town core in the first years of the 20th century, whereas small-scale local production and retail were realised in commercial areas and marketplaces in city centre (Figure 5.15).

Moreover, after 1897 earthquake, which caused a considerable destruction in numerous buildings of the city, and with the changes in the socio-economic structure, new and large streets were opened in areas nearby the traditional city centre in the beginnings of the 20th century, and thus, shops and department stores, as new commercial spaces, have started to take place on the ground floors of two or three storey buildings located on two sides of these new streets. Above-mentioned sprawl has largely taken place along Milli Kuvvetler Street opened in 1916 (Figure 5.16, Figure 5.17, Figure 5.18). At that time, local products were being sold around the city centre, while the imported goods started to be sold in the shops along İstasyon Caddesi, which connected station and military buildings to the municipal building. Thus, bipartite city structure, which could be seen in Anatolian towns around the 19th century, had also started to emerge in Balıkesir.

![Figure 5.15: Marketplace in Balıkesir in the 1930’s.](Source: Municipality of Balıkesir archive)

Particularly railway providing a new means of transport in Western Anatolian cities was another significant element causing the old caravan lines to lose their importance, and existing transportation network to differentiate. The construction of Bandırma-Izmir railroad and that it was started to be run by French investors had increased the importance of Balıkesir. The foreign goods brought to Bandırma port could be transferred even to inner areas of Western Anatolia through this railway line. The existence of railway had caused the first tendency of growth in Balıkesir to be in
the direction of railway station. Milli Kuvvetler Street or İstasyon Caddesi as known in the time when it was first built, became a new axis physically and functionally detached from the traditional core of city, and one with shops that sell goods brought from other cities and countries as well as with bank buildings on its both sides. Opening of the street and selling of imported goods on this new street were quite significant from the viewpoint that it was the generating point of the modernisation process in Balıkesir. In Eğli plan reports, too, the construction of new hotel buildings was recommended on this street which was in ‘close relation with commercial activities as well as with the station’. It is known that the number of hotels reached to 9 in 1958 with the construction of Yıldız, Çiçek, Çinili Palas and Çömlek Palas hotels in various dates, while in 1943 there were only five hotels, namely Ankara, İstiklal, Kaptan, Merkez and Ege hotels. İstasyon Caddesi has gradually become the new commercial area of the city formed by the buildings, ground floors of which were used for retail and upper floors were used as housing. Particularly, in 1940s and 1950s, the retail of various imported goods was going on in the shops along Milli Kuvvetler Street (Figure 5.19).

Figure 5.16 Milli Kuvvetler Street.
Figure 5.17  Milli Kuvvetler Street, Balikesir, 1920’s.  
(Source: Yerce Photography)

Figure 5.18  Milli Kuvvetler Street in the 1930’s.  
(Source: Yerce Photography)
5.2 Elucidation of Shopping Activities and Spaces in Current Context of Balıkesir with Particular Reference to the Study Area

At this juncture, arrived through a hierarchical investigation of social structure-shopping chain, the city will be analysed from the viewpoints of existing shopping spaces within the selected study area and their relationship with both social structure and urban fabric.

It was discussed that the transformation of urban fabric and shopping spaces in the study area, stems from the public-works at the beginning of the 20th century and their...
social and economic conditions. However, the period when this transformation becomes clearer is the period when traditional shopping spaces in city centre were largely replaced with new building complexes. The differentiation at that time is the point when the genuine break between traditional and modern shopping spaces was experienced. This break has also led the removal of the qualities once existed in the traditional fabric, and this area to become incapable of reflecting the unity of ‘urban fabric-social structure-shopping place’. The characteristics of this break can be summarised as follows:

1) Abatement of pedestrianised areas as a result of new constructions and vehicular traffic arrangements in 1950s, and the impairment of the relationship between pedestrian areas in different locations.

2) Distribution of legible and free-flowing nodes, which carries a potential to form ‘shopping places with social attributes’, in limited number and in non-optional manner, as well as that the necessary spatial arrangements were not completed in order to accentuate the significance of these nodes within the urban tissue.

Above-listed problems will be defined below in the light of the terminology established at the end of Chapter 4.

5.3 An Alternative Analysis of Existing Shopping Spaces in the Study Area

In this chapter, a series of suggestions will be put forward with regard to the consideration of spatial characteristics of ‘shopping places with social attributes’ at the design stage for future developments of shopping in Balıkesir in the light of above analyses.

5.3.1 Spatial Relations between Traditional and Current Shopping Spaces in the Study Area

In this section, the relations between traditional and contemporary shopping spaces will be analysed through the application of the approach developed in Chapter 4.

The objective of this section, is to make an evaluation regarding to what extent spatial characteristics transmitted from traditional fabric to the study area coincide with the characteristics of ‘shopping places with social attributes’, and whether this coincide would be a determining factor in future development of shopping spaces in the study area.
Throughout the investigation, firstly, the boundaries of the study area will be defined, later, the spatial characteristics of first the *paths*, then the *nodes* will be identified. Finally, characteristics of spatial organisation will be analysed.

The characteristics that were transmitted from traditional fabric to the study area will be identified within the framework of the approach developed in the fourth chapter, and along this path, the continuity of which spatial relationships pertaining to traditional fabric would be appropriate for the development of shopping spaces will be pinpointed. The provision of such continuity is an approach aiming to transmit spatial relations about ‘shopping places with social attributes’ that existed in traditional tissue, into the study area. Meanwhile, it will be discussed whether traditional assets and relationships put forward here, would also be effective for a contemporary shopping centre to be designed in future.

In the scope of this evaluation, to what extent the spatial organisation in the study area could provide the formation of ‘place’ will be set forth, and thus, a series of suggestions will be made regarding the solution of problems observed in the constitution of ‘shopping places with social attributes’.

### 5.3.1.1 Definition of the Boundaries of Shopping District

#### 5.3.1.1.1 Historical Criteria

The study area is a district which preserved its main characteristic of being the core and commercial district of the city for about 500 years. As stated in the sources, there was a very lively commercial activity around this area during 17th, 18th and 19th centuries.

#### 5.3.1.1.2 Functional Criteria

Today, the area sustains its commercial functions. This area is considered worthy of analysis mainly because it is an area where both traditional and contemporary shopping spaces are gathered together, yet traditional ways of shopping partially continue.

#### 5.3.1.1.3 Spatial Criteria

The area where characteristics of the tissue considerably differ is identified. The study area is limited with the market hall in the north, commercial buildings surrounding the periphery of the axis extending from Ali Hikmet Paşa Square (Figure
5.20) towards north, the part of Anafartalar Street which was built up after 1950s in the south, and in the west with Aygören quarter where housing is quite dense (Figure 5.21).
Figure 5.21  Boundaries of the study area.
5.3.1.2 Definitions of the Spatial Elements (Paths and Nodes) and the Qualities of These Elements

5.3.1.2.1 Paths

a) Distribution in the Study Area (distribution types)

1) Characteristics of the Fabric (organic/regular)

Study area was intended to be formed into a regular tissue taking its references from the organic street fabric of Aygören Quarter on its west, and a partially regular fabric of shopping streets was established via Yeni Çarşı building although an order as strict as that of Dumlupınar Quarter on its very south could not be obtained. However, it can be seen that the channelling of the pedestrian traffic mostly from south, east, and southeast directions (i.e. Anafartalar Street, Milli Kuvvetler Street and governmental centre) towards Zağnos Paşa Mosque (Figure 5.22), in other words, the provision of permeability between Ali Hikmet Paşa Square and Zağnos Paşa complex was intended (Figure 5.23).

![Zağnos Paşa Mosque](http://www.balikesir-bld.gov.tr/tarihtebazi.htm)
Figure 5.23  Tissue characteristics of the paths.
2) Type of Linkage Scheme (compositional form, mega form, group form)

In the study area, a premature type of linkage scheme which is composed of the resultant of both group form of the traditional fabric and compositional form of the modernist urban design approaches in the city (Figure 5.24). The reasons why group form could not be effective in city structure are mainly the public-works interventions of 1950s and doubtlessly their characteristics, which destroy the urban values once, existed in the traditional fabric. Compositional form, which is aimed through these interventions, could not be wholly implemented due to the facts that, on the one hand, traditional commercial relations have prevailed their salient features, and on the other hand, restrictions of interventions brought by the problem of ownership of the real estate. Consequently, what is arrived at is a spatial order, which is broken a part from tradition yet not totally modernised.

3) Distribution of Circulation Elements within the Study Area (linear/planar)

While this distribution displays a linear characteristic along Milli Kuvvetler Street and Anafartalar Street, which are the main arteries, a more planar distribution can be discerned in the area located in the north and west of Hasan Baba Çarşı. Additionally, Yeni Çarşı constitutes a different tissue, as a new model, with the inner streets created inside it. Even though this is not a totally planar distribution, it brings a new approach towards the interruption of linear distribution (Figure 5.23, Figure 5.28).

b) The Qualities of Circulation Elements within the Study Area

1) Continuity of Circulation Elements

As known, shopping is a pedestrian activity and thus requires a circulation area for pedestrians. It cannot be said that circulation elements in the study area are continuous in that sense. Although this continuity is physically possible, the inadequacy of functional diversity and visual richness makes the perception of this continuity much more difficult. On the other hand, these circulation elements are oriented mainly to vehicular traffic. Therefore, although the physical continuity can be partially provided for cars, vehicular circulations further interrupt the continuity already quite difficult from the viewpoint of pedestrian use (Figure 5.25). Thus, it can be noticed that the essential problem about the circulation within the study area lies on the issue of vehicular circulation. Moreover, the scarcity of pedestrian shortcuts, which are secondary elements of circulation continuity, further instigates these problems (Figure 5.26).
Figure 5.24 Types of linkage schemes in the study area.
Figure 5.25 Continuity of pedestrian circulation in the study area.
2) Number of Path Junctures on Nodes (whether or not they are optional)

It was previously stated that there is a linear relation between the number of junctions on the nodes and their potential for creating ‘place’. Therefore, the nodes in the study area where various paths intersect have great significance from the viewpoint of their capability of creating the appropriate context for ‘shopping places with social attributes’ within the urban fabric. Nevertheless, these nodes are mostly utilised as vehicular traffic junctions, the possibility of creating such places in these locations are considerably weakened. These nodes can be listed as in the below:

Table 10 Distribution of circulation elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of the node</th>
<th>Number of intersecting circulation elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ali Hikmet Paşa Square</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Intersection of Yeni Çarşısı-Hasan Baba Çarşısı</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The area in the south of market hall</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The area used as bus stops in the west of market hall</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The courtyard used as bus stops in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The area where Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Yeni Çarşısı intersect</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The area in the north of İncirli Mosque</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
c) Length of Circulation Elements

The length of circulation elements are investigated under three different categories pertaining to the traditional town fabric:

a. 0-50 m.: It is the average street length that is observable in cul-de-sacs.

b. 50-100 m.: It is the average street length that is observable in housing fabric.

c. 100-150 m.: It is the average length of the streets connecting the areas of urban services and streets related with commercial activities which mostly take place in traditional city centre.

Table 11 Lengths of circulation elements in the study area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Circulation elements no</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>110 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>100 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>90 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>85 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>65 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>75 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>70 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>85 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>100 meter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>45 meter</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Almost all of these elements can be grouped within categories a or b, and thus, provide the dimensional characteristics of street layout of the traditional city. When their distribution is examined, one can see that the category, which is valid in the central district where shopping is quite intense, is b with 50-100 m. length (Figure 5.27).

* As mentioned in the third chapter, the most effective distance for attracting customers is between 90-120 m. in contemporary shopping centres. This, in fact, is the optimum distance observed in arasta and traditional urban fabric.
Figure 5.27  Lengths of circulation elements in the study area.
This distribution pattern has a characteristic which helps perceptibility, thus legibility of commercial-urban spaces. Circulation element with number 9 can constitute a striking example of this sort. This street is perceived as two parts of 55 and 45 meters because of the twist although it is actually about 100 meters long. This twist, contributes to the unity of urban space-shopping space-pedestrian flow, simply by helping the easy perception of both the geometric structure of Yeni Çarşı, and urban landmarks in the area. Meanwhile, it lays the foundations for a spatial organisation which can enhance the formation of ‘place’.

It is significant that one of the factors, which determine the spatial organisation and mass composition, is the length of circulation elements. Thus, one of the crucial characteristics, which can constitute a bridge between fabric of the shopping places in traditional city and contemporary shopping centres, is the length of streets.

d) Orientation and Angles of Circulation Elements (Linear/angular)

In the study area, it can be seen that circulation elements are connected with each other through various angles (Figure 5.28). Only in Yeni Çarşı a linear and orthogonal street layout can be observed. Yet this layout is not in total contrast with the angular street layout, on the contrary, it delicately associates with this fabric through various articulations.

The street layout, which has an order almost totally angular, is one of the characteristics, which associate the study area with traditional city. Despite the public-works interventions, conducted throughout the time, traditional tissue characteristics are partially preserved. Though its perception, thus formation of a ‘shopping places with social attributes’ is obstructed due to various factors named above.

e) Rhythmic Characteristics of Commercial-Urban Blocks (existence/absence of rhythmic order)

When the dimensions of urban blocks are examined, one can notice the traces of a rhythm, in the past, among the blocks located in the north of market hall. Today, rhythmic order seems to have lost around Hasan Baba Çarşı, and displays a development towards a non-rhythmic order consisting of two or more blocks merging together. Hasan Baba Çarşı offers a rhythmic order within its interior space with sensitive references to the urban fabric which itself replaced (through reorganising the rhythmic elements in the fabric), while on the other hand, it connects the main circulation elements in the east and west thus two crucial commercial spaces of the city through the spatial division within itself.
Figure 5.28 Orientations and angles of circulation elements in the study area
It is seen in Yeni Çarş that, in spite of its strict planning approach, it attempts to rehabilitate the rhythms of the commercial urban block by the spatial organisation it offers through the dimensions that are reminiscent of traditional fabric.

Thus, these two shopping complexes provide the conditions required for creating ‘shopping places with social attributes’ within themselves. Nevertheless, the failure of the relationship between them (i.e. lack of an arrangement organising pedestrian flow in between them) may have caused to the loss of the conditions of urban unity in the traditional fabric.

On the other hand, it can be seen that Yeni Çarş consists of a group of buildings which have the potential of creating ‘shopping places with social attributes’ since they represent the traditional characteristics to the maximum level when compared to the other shopping areas of the city. Yet, Hasan Baba Çarş within itself also displays a potential to form ‘shopping places with social attributes’ with its spatial characteristics that refers to traditional shopping places (Figure 5.29).

However, it is also seen that this building establishes a model excluding the social values which should be transmitted from the city to the building while traditional urban fabric is being ’internalised’ (see Chapter 2) since various spatial features pertaining to traditional shopping spaces are not adequately transmitted. Therefore, this building reflects the architectural and urban problems brought with the concept of ‘internalisation’. These problems can be summarised as; the building weakens the perceptibility and legibility of space with its multi-levelled spatial organisation; it cannot be integrated with the rest of the city since it is totally introverted; it does not accommodate functional diversity in a way to contain spaces for social activities.
5.3.1.2.2 Nodes

a) Spatial Characteristics (piecemeal/m onolithic, complex/simple, free and organic/strict and regular) (see Figure 5.30)

Table 12 Spatial characteristics of the nodes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of the node</th>
<th>Spatial characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ali Hikmet Paşa Square</td>
<td>Monolithic, simple, strict yet irregular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Intersection of Yeni Çarşı-Hasan Baba Çarşı</td>
<td>Monolithic, simple, irregular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The area in the south of market hall</td>
<td>Piecemeal, complex, free and organic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The area used as bus stops in the west of market hall</td>
<td>Monolithic, simple, organic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The courtyard used as bus stops in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque</td>
<td>Piecemeal, simple, free and organic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The area where Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Yeni Çarşı intersect</td>
<td>Piecemeal, complex, organic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The area in the north of İncirli Mosque</td>
<td>Piecemeal, complex, organic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) Geometric-Typological Characteristics (square, circle, triangle, amorphous, and their combinations) (see Figure 5.30)

Table 13 Geometric-typological characteristics of the nodes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of the node</th>
<th>Geometric-typological characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ali Hikmet Paşa Square</td>
<td>Triangle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Intersection of Yeni Çarşı-Hasan Baba Çarşı</td>
<td>Triangle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The area in the south of market hall</td>
<td>Amorphous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The area used as bus stops in the west of market hall</td>
<td>Rectangular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The courtyard used as bus stops in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque</td>
<td>Trapezoid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The area where Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Yeni Çarşı intersect</td>
<td>Triangle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The area in the north of İncirli Mosque</td>
<td>Amorphous</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 5.30  Geometric-typological characteristics of the nodes
c) Enclosure Level (closed, semi-closed, unclosed) (see Figure 5.31)

Table 14  Enclosure levels of nodes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of the node</th>
<th>Enclosure level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ali Hikmet Paşa Square</td>
<td>Unenclosed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Intersection of Yeni Çarşı-Hasan Baba Çarşı</td>
<td>Semi-enclosed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The area in the south of market hall</td>
<td>Semi-enclosed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The area used as bus stops in the west of market hall</td>
<td>Enclosed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The courtyard used as bus stops in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque</td>
<td>Semi-enclosed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The area where Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Yeni Çarşı intersect</td>
<td>Unenclosed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The area in the north of İncirli Mosque</td>
<td>Semi-enclosed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d) Balance of Shopping Activity-Social Activity [functional diversity]
   (shopping dominant, social activity dominant, equal weight) (see Figure 5.31)

Table 15  Shopping activity-social activity equilibrium in the nodes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of the node</th>
<th>Shopping activity-social activity equilibrium</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ali Hikmet Paşa Square</td>
<td>Shopping dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Intersection of Yeni Çarşı-Hasan Baba Çarşı</td>
<td>Shopping dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The area in the south of market hall</td>
<td>Equal weight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The area used as bus stops in the west of market hall</td>
<td>Shopping dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The courtyard used as bus stops in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque</td>
<td>Equal weight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The area where Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Yeni Çarşı intersect</td>
<td>Shopping dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The area in the north of İncirli Mosque</td>
<td>Shopping dominant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 5.31  Enclosure levels of the nodes
Figure 5.32    Shopping activity-social activity equilibrium
e) Distribution Types of Nodes (linear/planar) (Figure 5.33)

Nodes, in the study area, have the general characteristics of a planar distribution. Despite, circulation options, which determine the planar distribution, are impaired by vehicular traffic, and therefore, their perception as planar is quite difficult.

The planar structure in the distribution of nodes partially reflects the characteristics of traditional fabric (Figure 5.33). However, the reduction of pedestrian areas after 1950s’ interventions and traffic arrangements and the impairment of the relations between pedestrianised areas, seem to have caused that spatial organisations to accentuate the significance of these nodes within urban fabric, could not be made. Therefore, the nodes cannot be perceived at all, let alone being perceived linearly or planar, mainly because they neither do have genuine characteristics to be able to gather and distribute people, nor are related to one another. Only nodes with number 4 and 5 can be perceived since they are currently used as bus stops and thus they continually collect and distribute people from and into the city.
Figure 5.33   Distribution types of nodes in the study area
5.3.1.3 Definition of the Characteristics of Spatial Organisation

5.3.1.3.1 Figure-Ground Relationship (grid, angular, curvilinear, radial, axial, organic)

The area exhibits an organic distribution of solids and voids (Figure 5.34). Thus, one can suggest that figure-ground equilibrium also has the same characteristics with the figure-ground relationship of traditional city. However, in Yeni Çarşı, angular and linear solid-void equilibrium is much more noticeable. This strict solid-void equilibrium in Yeni Çarşı seems to be injected into the traditional urban structure.

5.3.1.3.2 Spatial Hierarchy (provision/absence of hierarchical order)

Although there is a great potential to form a hierarchical order from the viewpoints of form, enclosure, position and size, one cannot fail to notice that such an order does not exist (Figure 5.26, Figure 5.33). However, it is possible to talk about the existence of a functional hierarchy in the study area. This hierarchy manifests itself as the location of food retail along major circulation elements whereas that of endurable consumer goods in the inner parts of the district.

5.3.1.3.3 Classification of Spatial Organisation Types (central, linear, radial, cluster, grid)

It can be seen that the spatial elements in this area generally have a cluster type of organisation, yet linear spatial organisation of Yeni Çarşı differentiates from this overall organisation.

5.3.1.3.4 Classification of Spatial Combinatory Relationships

It can be seen that urban components in the area are usually the spaces connected with another space (each node having the quality of a square are connected with a circulation element that is another space) (Figure 5.35). However, it is also possible to observe other relationships, although vaguely, such as interlocking and adjacent spaces particularly in the nodes with numbers 3, 4, and 5.
Figure 5.34  Figure-ground relationships in the study area
Figure 5.35  Spatial combinatory relationships in the study area
5.3.2 Visual Analysis of Study Area

In this section, a method which is based on Cullen’s serial vision and which investigates visual perception of users and thus their experiences as social beings, towards the identification of the problems regarding the organisation of nodes and connecting paths in the circulation area, is applied. Through below-given successive photography, it is intended to put forward the spatial problems in the area. To this aim, the urban spatial organisation, which a pedestrian starting from the square in front of İncirli Mosque, and form behind Yeni Çarşı going towards Ali Hikmet Paşa Square, then again via Yeni Çarşı to Zağnos Paşa Mosque, then to Hasan Baba Çarşı, and finally to market hall and adjacent squares (Figure 5.36) perceives in continuity is documented (Figure 5.37-Figure 5.79), and the problematic spots in the formation of ‘shopping places with social attributes’ are identified.
Figure 5.36  Route of the visual analysis in the study area
Figure 5.37 The square in front of Incirli Mosque, characteristics of organic tissue.

Figure 5.38 The square in front of Incirli Mosque, the building block impairing the unity of the square.
Figure 5.39  The square in front of İncirli Mosque, peripheral conditions impairing the scale and enclosure level of the traditional fabric.

Figure 5.40  The square in front of İncirli Mosque, spatial vagueness of the square obstructing the perception.
Figure 5.41 Contribution of diverse angles and building alignments in the street behind Yeni Çarşısı to the spatial diversity.

Figure 5.42 Contribution of inner streets in Yeni Çarşısı to spatial permeability.
Figure 5.43  Contribution of diverse angles and building alignments in the street behind Yeni Çarşısı to the spatial diversity.

Figure 5.44  Ali Hikmet Paşa Square and the problem of lack of definition.

Figure 5.45  Ali Hikmet Paşa Square and the problem of lack of definition.
Figure 5.46  A view from Ali Hikmet Paşa Square to Yeni Çarşı.

Figure 5.47  A view from Milli Kuvvetler Street towards Ali Hikmet Paşa Square and Yeni Çarşı.
Figure 5.48  Ali Hikmet Paşa Square and problems observed in its peripheral conditions.

Figure 5.49  Spatial definition created by Yeni Çarşısı and the pedestrian continuity interrupted by vehicular traffic.
Figure 5.50  A view inside Yeni Çarşı, an urban stage-set established by traditional ways of shopping in a pedestrian area.

Figure 5.51  A view from the arcades of Yeni Çarşı to Zağnos Paşa Mosque and Market hall, vehicular traffic and destruction of urban ensemble created by the grouping of various functions.
Figure 5.52  From Yeni Çarşı to the space in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque, problem of the lack of definition.

Figure 5.53  From the square in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque to Yeni Çarşı, definition of sub-space by the trees which constitute the boundaries of the courtyard of the mosque.
Figure 5.54  Square in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque, relationship between square and mosque.

Figure 5.55  A view from Zağnos Paşa Mosque towards the square on its west, the problem of enclosure, and the impairment of spatial unity with bus stops.
Figure 5.56  The street connecting Market hall square to the square in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque, and its definition with buildings and landscape elements.

Figure 5.57  The street connecting Market hall square to the square in the west of Zağnos Paşa Mosque, sub-space created in the court with a level difference.
Figure 5.58  A view from Zağnos Paşa Mosque to Yeni Çarşı.

Figure 5.59  The street in the North of Yeni Çarşı, contribution of the unity of human-building-nature which existed in traditional fabric for the formation of 'shopping places with social attributes'.
Figure 5.60 The street in the North of Yeni Çarşı, contribution of the unity of human-building-nature which existed in traditional fabric for the formation of ‘shopping places with social attributes’.

Figure 5.61 The gathering spaces to which all streets in Yeni Çarşı open, the space performs as a node within shopping complex and offers a multi-optional spatial order to its users.
Figure 5.62  A street view inside Yeni Çarş. 

Figure 5.63  Disharmony between traditional and new spaces on a peripheral location where traditional features start to diminish.
Figure 5.64  A view from the eastern boundary of the study area towards Yeni Çarşı.

Figure 5.65  A view from the eastern boundary of the study area towards Yeni Çarşı and Zağnos Paşa Mosque.
Figure 5.66  Hasan Baba Çarşı, an initiative to reorganise urban space within a building.

Figure 5.67  Hasan Baba Çarşı, the relation between reorganised inner-urban space with the exit to the urban space itself.
Figure 5.68  Hasan Baba Çarşı, spatial richness via level differences within the building and visual relations.

Figure 5.69  A view from the central circular space of Hasan Baba Çarşı, the weakening of characteristics pertaining to traditional shopping space due to the growth of building in the third dimension.
Figure 5.70  An initiative to constitute ‘place’ in the central circular space of Hasan Baba Çarşı by means of functional diversity.

Figure 5.71  Disharmony between contemporary spatial understanding in Hasan Baba Çarşı with prevailing ways of traditional shopping.
Figure 5.72  A view from the west exit of Hasan Baba Çarşı to Zağnos Paşa Mosque, contribution of the unity of human-nature-building and functional diversity to the formation of ‘shopping places with social attributes’.

Figure 5.73  A view from the west exit of Hasan Baba Çarşı to the square in front of market hall, destruction of spatial unity with vehicular traffic.
Figure 5.74  A view from market hall to Zağnos Paşa Mosque, contribution of the unity of human-nature-building and functional diversity to the formation of ‘shopping places with social attributes’.

Figure 5.75  A view from market hall to Hasan Baba Çarşı, as the result of introverted relationship established with the city, the impairment of the unity of ‘urban space-shopping place’ that existed in traditional shopping space.
Figure 5.76  A view from market hall to Zağnos Paşa Mosque.

Figure 5.77  The South elevation of the square in the west side of market hall, despite its enclosure, the difficulty of perceiving the positive space due to the lack of unity along the peripheral conditions.
Figure 5.78  The west elevation of the square in the west of market hall, despite its enclosure, the difficulty of perceiving the positive space due to the lack of unity along the peripheral conditions.

Figure 5.79  The east (market hall) elevation of the square in the west side of market hall.
5.3.2.1 Problems

The urban problems highlighted through the above-conducted visual analysis can be grouped as below:

5.3.2.1.1 Problems Regarding Circulation Elements

- Vagueness of the type of linkage scheme,
- Dominance of the linear distribution of linkage elements,
- Impairment of pedestrian flow by vehicular traffic arrangements,
- Impairment of the unity of spatial perception as a result of the absence of rhythmic order among plot sizes.

5.3.2.1.2 Problems Regarding Nodes

- Nodes are formally complete, yet functionally disintegrated via vehicular traffic and bus stops,
- Vague qualities from the viewpoint of geometric features, and resulting difficulty in perception,
- Inadequacy of enclosure level and resulting difficulties in their perception as positive urban spaces,
- Isolation of nodes from social functions for the sake of providing spaces for mere shopping and thus, insufficiency of the unity of social place-shopping place.

5.3.2.1.3 Problems Regarding Spatial Organisation

- The contradiction between organic solid-void relationship and Yeni Çarşı’s linear figure-ground relationship, thus resulting deficiency in the legibility of space by pedestrians,
- Difficulties in the legibility due to the lack of hierarchical order (spatially and spatially) among the various spatial components,
- Spatial disintegration stemming form the fact that linear spatial organisation of Yeni Çarşı and cluster type of organisation in the remaining areas which reflect traditional characteristics of the fabric, are not well integrated,
- Difficulties in orientation originating from the fact that spatial diversity which enables the fluidity required for the perceptual continuity, could not be provided particularly in the combination of spaces.
5.3.3 Proposals for Shopping Centre Development in Balıkesir

In this section, various suggestions for a future development of shopping spaces in Balıkesir will be presented within the framework of the approach developed in Chapter 4, aiming the preservation of the unity of ‘urban fabric-shopping place’.

Similar to the approach used in the analyses of the study area, the proposals here, will also follow an order starting with proposals for circulation elements, then those for nodes and spatial organisation.

5.3.3.1 Proposals Regarding Circulation Elements

• Clarification of the type of linkage schemes as group form,
• Conversion of the distribution of linkage elements into planar arrangement,
• Arrangement of vehicular and pedestrian traffics in a manner to support above-stated planar distribution,
• Reorganisation of rhythmic order in a way to provide the urban ensemble of the traditional fabric.

5.3.3.2 Proposals Regarding Nodes

• Formation of piecemeal and complex spatial character in the nodes,
• Transformation of the nodes which exhibit amorphous geometric qualities into those with clear geometric shapes,
• Peripheral arrangements to improve the level of enclosure in these urban spaces,
• Conversion of nodes dominated by shopping activity into those with equal weight of both shopping and social activities.

5.3.3.3 Proposals Regarding Spatial Organisation

In connection with the proposals regarding circulation elements and nodes;

• Enhancement of the connections between organic solid-void relationship and linear figure-ground relationship,
• Making advantage of the potential which these urban spaces have to form a hierarchical order and making necessary arrangements to establish spatial/spatial hierarchy besides the functional one,
• Spatial arrangements required for a better integration of linear and cluster spatial organisations,

• In regard to spatial combinatory relationships, the deployment of other types (such as space within space, interlocking spaces, adjacent spaces as well as spaces connected with another space) in order to provide required level of spatial diversity.